

1 **Strategies for improving phosphorus acquisition efficiency of crop**  
2 **plants**

3 **Lara Ramaekers<sup>a</sup>, Roseline Remans<sup>c</sup>, Idupulapati M. Rao<sup>b</sup>, Matthew W. Blair<sup>b</sup>**  
4 **and Jozef Vanderleyden<sup>a</sup>**

5 <sup>a</sup>Center of Microbial and Plant Genetics, Department of Microbial and Molecular  
6 Systems, K.U. Leuven, Kasteelpark Arenberg 20, 3001 Heverlee, Belgium.

7 <sup>b</sup>International Center for Tropical Agriculture/Centro Internacional de Agricultura  
8 Tropical (CIAT), A.A. 6713, Cali, Colombia.

9 <sup>c</sup>The Earth Institute at Columbia University, 405 Low Library, MC 4335 535 West  
10 116th Street New York, NY 10027, USA

11

12 Correspondence: Prof. Dr. Jozef Vanderleyden, Center of Microbial and Plant  
13 Genetics, K.U.Leuven, Kasteelpark Arenberg 20, 3001 Leuven, Belgium

14 Email: [jozef.vanderleyden@biw.kuleuven.be](mailto:jozef.vanderleyden@biw.kuleuven.be)

15 Fax : +32 16 32 19 63

16

17

\*Prof. Dr. Jozef Vanderleyden, Center of Microbial and Plant Genetics, K.U.Leuven,  
Kasteelpark Arenberg 20, 3001 Leuven, Belgium

18 **ABSTRACT**

19 **In many low input agricultural systems, phosphorus (P) is one of the most**  
20 **limiting mineral nutrients for plant production. The use of genetically enhanced**  
21 **plants with improved P acquisition efficiency may represent the most**  
22 **sustainable solution to increase crop yields in these systems. This review is**  
23 **intended to provide a short summary on adaptation mechanisms of crop plants**  
24 **facing P deficiency as the starting point to develop a research approach for**  
25 **improving P acquisition efficiency. This includes three strategies: molecular**  
26 **assisted plant breeding, genetic engineering and the use of agricultural**  
27 **practices. The natural source for improving P nutrition of plants is existing**  
28 **large genetic variation for traits associated with P acquisition efficiency and will**  
29 **therefore be emphasized in this review.**

30

31 Keywords: phosphorus acquisition, phosphorus deficient soils, genetic variation,  
32 food crops

33

34 **1. Introduction**

35

36 Phosphorus (P) deficiency is considered a major limiting factor in crop productivity,  
37 especially in the tropics and subtropics. Compared to other major nutrients, P is by  
38 far the least mobile and least available to plants in most soil conditions (Schachtman  
39 et al., 1998; Hinsinger, 2001). Some soils such as sandy soils possess low total P  
40 contents and are not able to retain added P by fertilization (WRB soil classification  
41 system; Driessen et al., 2001). However, most soils that have little P available for the  
42 plant do contain considerable amounts of P but a large proportion is bound to  
43 different soil constituents, forming complexes of limited availability (Fairhurst et al.,  
44 1999; Driessen et al., 2001). In both cases, the concentration of phosphate (Pi) in soil  
45 solution is suboptimal for crop production. Soils with low total P content can be  
46 amended with P fertilizer but are not able to retain the added P. Soils with high total  
47 P content that fix most of the P, will equally fix a large proportion of added P. In  
48 these P-fixing tropical soils, plants respond to P fertilizer application but annual P

49 applications are needed to sustain crop yields (Sanchez, 1976). An alternative  
50 approach for both soils with low P content and P-fixing soils, is to enhance the  
51 plant's efficiency to acquire soil P (Shenoy and Kalagudi, 2005; Lynch, 2007;  
52 Fageria et al., 2008). In this essay, we review the different mechanisms used by crop  
53 plants to improve their P acquisition efficiency. Progress in a more detailed  
54 understanding of these mechanisms holds great promise for developing strategies  
55 that build upon the observed explorative behavior of plant roots. We present a  
56 research approach involving three strategies that may lead to improved P acquisition  
57 by crop plants. Firstly, traditional plant breeding for enhanced P acquisition is a  
58 feasible strategy as shown by a range of inheritance studies and the breeding of  
59 improved common bean lines with greater P acquisition and better tolerance to low P  
60 soils. Secondly, genetic engineering can be used to introduce genes that improve P  
61 acquisition and growth of crop plants. A third strategy focuses on the use of  
62 agricultural practices to enhance plant growth under P deficient conditions through  
63 inoculation with Plant Growth-Promoting Rhizobacteria (PGPR) and mycorrhizae.  
64 Throughout this review, the inter- and intraspecific genetic variation for traits  
65 involved in P acquisition efficiency is highlighted. While this genetic variation is  
66 undoubtedly essential for improving P acquisition by plants, it may also cause  
67 divergent outcomes for a given strategy applied.

68

69

## 70 **1. Plant mechanisms for improving P acquisition efficiency**

71 Crop plants are a very diverse group with both monocot and dicot members.  
72 Dicotyledonous plants are characterized by a taproot system with a prominent  
73 primary root and basal roots arising from the mesocotyl or hypocotyl, which together  
74 form the main root axes. Monocots, on the other hand, display a shoot-borne root  
75 system with multiple root axes resulting in a fibrous root system. An extensive  
76 discussion on the root development and structure of monocots and dicots is provided  
77 by Gregory (2006). Although the root architecture in monocots and dicots differs  
78 significantly, the main adaptive root traits correlated with enhanced P acquisition are  
79 common among all vascularized plant species. P is an element that is relatively

80 immobile in the soil. Therefore, the main strategy for P acquisition is maximal and  
81 continued soil exploration through proliferation and extension of all root types with  
82 preference for those roots that are metabolically efficient and acquire P avidly  
83 (Lynch and Ho, 2005).

84

85 Plants exposed to P deficiency activate a range of mechanisms that either result in  
86 increased acquisition of P from the soil or in a more efficient use of the internal P  
87 (Vance et al., 2003). This section focuses on plant mechanisms related to increased P  
88 acquisition. Figure 1 assembles and integrates these mechanisms in a plant model.  
89 Importantly, this figure clearly shows all possible differences between a P-efficient  
90 genotype and a P-inefficient genotype. One or several of these differences often  
91 explain the higher tolerance of P efficient genotypes to P deficiency compared to P  
92 inefficient genotypes. More extensive reviews on these mechanisms are available  
93 (Vance et al., 2003; Lambers et al., 2006; Lynch and Brown, 2006; Richardson et al.,  
94 2009b) and therefore, only a short overview with emphasis on genetic variation for  
95 these traits is provided.

96

#### 97 *1.1. Increase of root- to- shoot ratio*

98 A common response to P deficiency is an increase in root-to-shoot dry weight ratio,  
99 due to a greater stimulation of root growth at the expense of shoot growth (Mollier  
100 and Pellerin, 1999; Hermans et al., 2006; figure 1). In a study with common bean,  
101 Nielsen et al. (2001) showed that P-efficient genotypes maintained a higher root-to-  
102 shoot ratio during their growth under P deficient conditions as compared to P-  
103 inefficient genotypes.

#### 104 *1.2. Redistribution of growth among root types*

105 Low P availability also changes the distribution of growth among various root types  
106 (Drew, 1975; Hodge, 2004; Hodge, 2009). In the model plant *Arabidopsis thaliana*  
107 and various rape cultivars, a highly branched root system with reduced primary root  
108 (PR) and an increase in the number and length of lateral roots (LR) was observed  
109 when seedlings were grown under low P availability (López-Bucio et al., 2003;  
110 Pérez-Torres et al., 2008; Akhtar et al., 2008; figure 1). However, in other crop

111 plants, elongation of the main root axes is maintained under low P (Mollier and  
112 Pellerin, 1999). This could be interpreted as exploratory behavior, allowing these  
113 roots to grow maximally until they encounter localized patches of higher P  
114 availability. The response of lateral rooting under P stress, however, shows genetic  
115 variation within species. In maize, some genotypes show an increase in LR number  
116 and length while others show a decrease. The genotypes with increased or sustained  
117 LR development have superior ability to acquire P and maintain growth (Zhu and  
118 Lynch, 2004).

### 119 *1.3. Stimulation of root hair growth*

120 Another common adaptation to low P is the stimulation of root hair growth (Lynch,  
121 2007; figure 1). By enhancing both root hair length and density, the soil volume  
122 subject to P depletion by roots significantly increases. In the model plant  
123 *Arabidopsis*, root hair density was 29% higher and low P root hairs grew three times  
124 as long as high P root hairs after 16 days of P starvation (Bates and Lynch, 1996).  
125 Substantial genetic variation for these traits is found among genotypes of different  
126 crop plants including wheat, barley (Gahoonia et al., 1997) and among recombinant  
127 inbred lines of common bean (Yan et al., 2004). In common bean, root hair length  
128 and density of basal roots are correlated with P acquisition in the field (Yan et al.,  
129 2004) suggesting that in particular the basal root hairs are important for P  
130 acquisition. Various studies also indicate that root hairs may assist in the exudation  
131 of P-mobilizing compounds such as organic acids, protons and phosphatases. These  
132 compounds are able to liberate fixed P by (i) complexing and chelating cations  
133 bound to P, (ii) competing with phosphate ions for sorption sites, (iii)  
134 dephosphorylation of organic P and (iv) by acidifying the rhizosphere so that  
135 dissolution of sparingly soluble P minerals in alkaline soils is increased (this topic  
136 has been recently reviewed by Richardson et al., 2009b). P deficient conditions  
137 caused an 81% increase in the organic acid exudation rate in some lowland rice  
138 genotypes (Hoffland et al., 2006). Similar results were reported in four common  
139 bean genotypes with a two- to threefold increase in organic acid exudation after 7  
140 days of P starvation (Shen et al., 2002).

### 141 *1.4. Topsoil foraging*

142 In most natural soils, the topsoil is the layer with greatest bioavailability of P. As a  
143 consequence, root systems that enhance topsoil foraging will be able to acquire more  
144 P. Architectural traits associated with enhanced topsoil foraging in common bean  
145 include shallower growth of basal roots, increased adventitious rooting and greater  
146 dispersion of lateral branching from the basal roots (Lynch and Brown, 2006; Lynch,  
147 2007; figure 1). P efficient bean genotypes produce shallower basal roots in response  
148 to low P availability compared to P inefficient bean genotypes and P acquisition  
149 significantly correlates with basal root shallowness (Liao et al., 2001). Similar  
150 results have been observed in seminal roots of maize genotypes (analogous to basal  
151 roots in dicots – Zhu et al., 2005). Adventitious roots are common in many plants.  
152 This root type arises from the hypocotyl and grows horizontally just below the soil  
153 surface. As with basal root shallowness, genotypic and P-induced adventitious  
154 rooting vary widely among common bean genotypes (Miller et al., 2003) and are  
155 moderately heritable (Ochoa et al., 2006).

#### 156 *1.5. Soil exploration at minimal metabolic cost*

157 Another adaptation to P limitation that has been studied mainly in common bean is  
158 the exploration of the soil at minimal metabolic cost (Lynch and Brown, 2006;  
159 Lynch, 2007). One mechanism of reducing the root metabolic burden is to allocate  
160 relatively more biomass to root classes that are metabolically efficient in acquiring P  
161 such as adventitious roots and root hairs (figure 1). The production and maintenance  
162 of these root types needs less biomass as compared to tap and basal roots. Moreover,  
163 they greatly enlarge the absorptive surface area relative to the root volume making  
164 them more efficient in acquiring P. Miller et al. (2003) showed that at low P  
165 availability, a higher proportion of the root biomass of common bean is allocated to  
166 adventitious roots, especially in P-efficient genotypes. Another strategy to reduce P  
167 requirements of root growth is the induction of aerenchyma in roots (Fan et al.,  
168 2003; figure 1). Cortical cells are replaced with air space and the P released from the  
169 breakdown of the cortical tissue could be useful in meeting the P demands for root  
170 elongation. Substantial genotypic variation in aerenchyma formation in response to  
171 low P was observed in common bean and maize. Also in maize, root porosity seems

172 to be strongly correlated with sustained root growth under low P (Lynch and Brown,  
173 2006).

#### 174 *1.6. Association with mycorrhizae*

175 Association of crop plants with mycorrhizal fungi can also mediate the availability  
176 of P to plants through extension of the plant root system with mycorrhizal hyphae  
177 (Bucher, 2007; figure 1). Arbuscular mycorrhiza (AM) is probably the most  
178 widespread terrestrial symbiosis and is formed by 70-90% of land plant species  
179 (Parniske, 2008). In exchange for P and other nutrients supplied to the plant, the  
180 fungal symbiont obtains reduced carbon (Jacobsen et al., 2005). An extensive review  
181 on plant-mycorrhizae associations is provided by Parniske (2008). Improved P  
182 acquisition is the main benefit of AM symbioses. The beneficial effect for symbiotic  
183 P acquisition however depends on P nutrition. Several studies in maize inoculated  
184 with mycorrhizae report an increase in P acquisition and plant growth under low P  
185 conditions but a decrease for these parameters under high P conditions (Kaeppeler et  
186 al., 2000). The carbon cost of mycorrhizal symbioses could cause this detrimental  
187 effect under fertile conditions. In conditions of low available P, Kaeppeler et al.  
188 (2000) reported substantial variation among maize inbred lines for mycorrhizal  
189 responsiveness (defined as growth increase upon mycorrhizal inoculation). The  
190 genotypes with the lowest shoot dry weight showed highest growth increase  
191 compared to the genotypes with higher shoot dry weight. Clearly, more studies on  
192 genotypic variation for mycorrhizal responsiveness under conditions of varying P  
193 nutrition are needed.

#### 194 *1.7. Increased expression of high affinity P-transporters*

195 The concentration of P in root cells can be up to 1000-fold higher than the P-  
196 concentration in soil solution. In order to acquire P against this steep concentration  
197 gradient, P transport across the soil/root interface requires a specialized transport  
198 system. In plants, two P uptake systems have been identified, a high affinity system  
199 that is either increased or de-repressed under P deficiency and a low affinity system  
200 that is constitutively expressed (Ullrich-Eberius et al., 1984; Rausch and Bucher,  
201 2002). Plants can possess multiple P-transporters of each system. For example, nine  
202 transporter genes have been cloned from *Arabidopsis*, at least five from potato and

203 up to eight from barley. All cloned genes are members of the Pht1 family of plant P  
204 transporters and are highly conserved (Rausch and Bucher, 2002). Several studies  
205 report expression of *pht1* genes in different organs including root, shoot tissues and  
206 reproductive organs but highest expression is commonly found in root hairs (Mudge  
207 et al., 2002). More extensive information on P-uptake mechanisms at the root-soil  
208 interface is provided by Bucher (2007).

209

210 To date, no studies on plant genotypic variation in expression level or activity of P  
211 transporters and possible correlation with P acquisition efficiency have been  
212 reported. However, several mutants with aberrant phosphate transporter expression  
213 have been well described (Zakhleniuk et al., 2001; Shin et al., 2004; Xu et al., 2007)  
214 and suggest the presence of genetic variation among plant genotypes. Elucidating  
215 this genotypic variation in P transporter expression/activity level could therefore be a  
216 very promising study.

217

218 Furthermore, little is known on the molecular pathways in the plant triggering these  
219 responses to P starvation (Hammond and White, 2008; Richardson, 2009).  
220 Svistoonoff et al. (2006) provide evidence for an important role of the root cap (tip  
221 of the primary root) in sensing P deficiency and/or responding to it in *Arabidopsis*.  
222 In the root cap, *low phosphate root 1* and 2 (LPR1 and LPR2) genes, which encode  
223 multicopper oxidases, are responsible for the ceasing of primary root growth under  
224 low P conditions. More recently, it was also shown that P-deficient *Arabidopsis*  
225 seedlings increase auxin sensitivity through increased expression of the TIR1 auxin  
226 receptor, leading to stimulation of lateral root formation under low P conditions  
227 (Pérez-Torres et al., 2008). However, increased lateral root formation seems to be  
228 independent of primary root growth inhibition. This is shown by the phosphate-  
229 insensitive *lpi3 Arabidopsis* mutant which does not show primary root growth arrest  
230 but still increases lateral root number under low P conditions (Pérez-Torres et al.,  
231 2008). Moreover, the lateral root formation of two mutants *lpr1-1* and *lpr1-2* and a  
232 near-isogenic line (NIL) carrying the recessive LPR1 allele which implies lower  
233 LPR1 expression, does not seem to be affected, although quantitative data for lateral

234 root number and length are not available (Svistoonoff et al., 2006). Thus, primary  
235 root growth arrest and increased lateral root formation as a response to P deprivation  
236 might be regulated independently in the plant root.

237 Another important component of the Pi-signaling network that is being unravelled is  
238 the microRNA399(miR399)/PHO2 pathway (Dong et al., 1998; Rubio et al., 2001;  
239 Hamburger et al., 2002; Miura et al., 2005; Fujii et al., 2005). Under P deficient  
240 conditions, this pathway activates a subset of P starvation-induced genes including  
241 high affinity P-transporter genes *Pht1;8* and *Pht1;9* in *Arabidopsis*. Moreover, the  
242 phenotype of the *pho2* mutant also indicates a role for PHO2 in systemic plant  
243 responses including regulation of P allocation between shoot and root. PHO2  
244 encodes an E2 conjugase that is modulated by the P-dependent miR399. The  
245 microRNA miR399 might be the mobile signal assuring coordinated responses to P  
246 deficiency between shoot and root (Bari et al., 2006). Bari et al. also show that P-  
247 dependent miR399 expression is conserved in rice and reveal close homologs of  
248 *Arabidopsis* PHO2 in several higher plant species including wheat, soybean and  
249 cotton. Therefore, the miR399/PHO2 pathway seems to be a conserved regulatory  
250 mechanism.

251 These findings are important steps towards resolving the complete signal  
252 transduction cascade for P-limitation in plants. However, the question as to how  
253 plants actually perceive P – and if it is the presence or the absence of P that acts as a  
254 signal – is key in our further understanding of the signaling pathway.

255 The background on the mechanisms for improving P acquisition, leads to three  
256 proven strategies for improving P efficiency of crop plants that we will discuss in the  
257 following section.

258

## 259 **2. Strategies for improving P acquisition efficiency of crop plants**

260

261 Phosphorus deficiency in soils is caused by a general low total P content of the soil  
262 or low bioavailability of P in the soil. In both cases, the main approach to benefit  
263 from applied as well as native fixed P is to target the plant root system to enhance P  
264 acquisition from the soil. Growth model simulations for rice showed that small

265 optimizations of the root system i.e. increasing root fineness, trigger large increases  
266 in P acquisition (Wissuwa, 2003). Those large increases are mainly due to enhanced  
267 root growth as a result of higher P acquisition per unit root size. Achieving these  
268 changes can be brought about through three strategies based on molecular breeding,  
269 the deployment of transgenics, and agricultural practices as described below.

270

271 ***Strategy 1: Molecular assisted plant breeding for enhanced tolerance to low P soils***

272 As mentioned in the previous section, genotypic variation for tolerance to P  
273 deficiency has been demonstrated in many food crops. This variation provides the  
274 source for developing cultivars that are superior in P acquisition and higher yielding  
275 in P deficient conditions through plant breeding (Zhang et al., 2007; Fageria et al.,  
276 2008; Hammond et al., 2008). Conventional plant breeding including phenotypic  
277 selection for improved root systems has proven to be difficult, prone to  
278 environmental effects, and time-consuming (Miklas et al., 2006). As tolerance to low  
279 P is a quantitative trait, an appropriate method to dissect its complex polygenic  
280 inheritance is through Quantitative Trait Loci (QTL) analysis. A QTL is a region in  
281 the genome that is responsible for variation in the quantitative trait of interest.  
282 Identifying and placing QTL on a genetic map is based on the statistically significant  
283 association of phenotypic differences for the trait of interest with molecular markers  
284 that constitute the genetic map (Doerge, 2001). Molecular markers found to be  
285 linked to the target trait can be used for selection in the breeding process (Marker-  
286 Assisted Selection, MAS).

287 A range of QTL have been identified for tolerance mechanisms to low P in various  
288 food crops (Kaepler et al., 2000; Wissuwa et al., 2005; Beebe et al., 2006). In  
289 common bean, some of these have been notably correlated with low P adaptation in  
290 the field despite being evaluated in hydroponic or greenhouse conditions (Yan et al.,  
291 2004). An association between low P tolerance and aluminum toxicity resistance  
292 QTL has also been found in common bean and could indicate the added importance  
293 of organic acid exudation (López-Marín et al., 2009).

294 Despite this progress, a remaining challenge is to utilize these QTL through marker  
295 assisted breeding. Research by Heuer et al. (2009) provides one of the very few

296 examples in which attempts are undertaken to further dissect a major QTL for  
297 phosphorus acquisition (*Pup1*) in rice. This QTL had been identified in a Kasalath  
298 (tolerant) × Nipponbare (sensitive) population. Nipponbare near-isogenic lines  
299 (NILs) carrying the *Pup1* donor allele from Kasalath increased P acquisition and  
300 grain yield by a factor of three to four relative to the sensitive Nipponbare recurrent  
301 parent under P deficient conditions. Interestingly, all NILs developed a root system  
302 similar to Nipponbare under P sufficient conditions suggesting that *Pup1* entails a  
303 specific adaptation to P deficiency. Moreover, this effect under low P did not seem  
304 to be limited to a Nipponbare genetic background or to the specific environment.  
305 Introgression of *Pup1* into the background of two other tropical rice cultivars by  
306 MAS and evaluation at other sites showed that the variability among introgression  
307 lines was high but the majority outperformed both recurrent parents (Wissuwa et al.,  
308 2005). These findings illustrate the possible fast progress that could be achieved  
309 upon transfer of the *Pup1* allele to elite breeding material lacking tolerance to P  
310 deficiency. Further efforts are ongoing to identify gene(s) underlying this locus  
311 (Heuer et al., 2009).

312 In general, however, the achievements of MAS for tolerance to low P are limited  
313 (Steele et al., 2006). This limited success is due to difficulties such as epistatic  
314 interactions between QTL and the identification of many QTL each with only small  
315 impact. Moreover, some QTL can show poor stability across different mapping  
316 populations and environments and in new genetic backgrounds. MAS is most  
317 effective for introgression of few stable QTL with large effects (Miklas et al., 2006).  
318 It is also important to narrow down the QTL region as much as possible so that  
319 linkage drag is reduced and only target genes are transferred. With the identification  
320 of a growing number of genes involved in response to low P (Valdéz-López and  
321 Hernández, 2008; Yuan and Liu, 2008), the search for candidate genes within a QTL  
322 will be facilitated.

323

### 324 ***Strategy 2: Development of transgenic plants***

325 Several attempts have been made to improve specific P acquisition processes in food  
326 crops through genetic engineering with specific bacterial, fungal or plant genes.

327 Focus has been mainly on genes enhancing solubilization of P in the soil. An  
328 overview of reported transgenic crop plants is given in table 1. López-Bucio et al.  
329 (2000) introduced a bacterial citrate synthase gene into tobacco (*Nicotiana tabacum*)  
330 and reported a two- to fourfold increase of the citrate efflux by roots of transgenic  
331 lines and superior growth and yield in low P alkaline soils. However, Delhaize et al.  
332 (2001) could not confirm these results. Many studies (summarized in table 1) also  
333 report transgenic overexpression of phytase in various food crops. Phytases are  
334 exuded into the rhizosphere and are able to hydrolyse phytate which constitutes up to  
335 50% of the total organic P in soil (Anderson, 1980). Overexpression of phytase in  
336 potato, clover, soybean and tobacco resulted in increased P acquisition and content.  
337 Increasing knowledge on regulatory and signalling mechanisms involved in P  
338 acquisition might identify new useful genes (Valdéz-López and Hernández, 2008;  
339 Yuan and Liu, 2008). As P transport and P solubilization are processes that seem to  
340 be closely linked to root hairs, a combined overexpression of P transporters and P  
341 solubilizers might result in synergistic effects.  
342 Despite promising experimental results, to date, no transgenic lines have been  
343 released for commercial use. Genetic engineering is not always very robust and  
344 easily reproducible and still remains a controversial societal issue that has strict  
345 regulatory control compared to conventional crop improvement. Furthermore, plant  
346 varieties are highly diverse each with very different genetic backgrounds and  
347 varying reactions to low P soils. Therefore, transferring one gene across multiple  
348 backgrounds could give divergent outcomes.

349

### 350 ***Strategy 3: Agricultural practices to enhance plant growth in low P soils***

351 Agricultural practices that enhance acquisition of P from the soil include the  
352 inoculation of food crops with plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria (PGPR) or  
353 mycorrhizae (Rengel and Marschner, 2005; Hodge et al., 2009). One advantage to  
354 this strategy is that the use of these microbes can complement products from plant  
355 breeding or transgenesis described above.

356 In the first case, PGPR can directly increase plant available P via mechanisms of  
357 solubilization and mineralization of fixed P from inorganic and organic forms. These

358 mechanisms include the release of organic acids, protons and phosphatases into the  
359 rhizosphere. Bacteria from the genera *Pseudomonas* and *Bacillus* and fungi,  
360 primarily *Penicillium* and *Aspergillus*, are among the most powerful P solubilizers.  
361 Another mechanism which indirectly leads to increased P acquisition by plants, is  
362 the production of phytohormones (mainly auxins) by rhizobacteria that stimulate  
363 root growth (Richardson, 2001; Jacobsen et al., 2005; Richardson et al., 2009a).  
364 Inoculation with *Azospirillum*, known to produce substantial amounts of indole-3-  
365 acetic-acid (IAA), increases the length and density of root hairs as well as the  
366 appearance and elongation rates of lateral roots in many plant species (Fallik et al.,  
367 1994). Inoculation with *Azospirillum* thus triggers a natural stimulation of root  
368 adaptation to low P soils. Its effect can now be better understood in view of the  
369 recent finding of Pérez-Torres et al. (2008) that P deficiency in *Arabidopsis*  
370 seedlings increases auxin sensitivity through increased expression of the TIR1 auxin  
371 receptor, leading to stimulation of lateral root formation. However, under low P  
372 conditions, contrasting effects of *Azospirillum* on plant root development and yield  
373 have been detected among genotypes of wheat (Kucey, 1988) and common bean  
374 (Remans et al., 2008b). Remans et al. (2008a) further identified this differential  
375 response as a contrasting root sensitivity to the bacterial produced auxin and  
376 identified a QTL for root responsiveness to auxin. Nevertheless, this study highlights  
377 the possibility of breeding for cultivars with improved root responsiveness to auxin-  
378 producing bacteria. It might also explain inconsistent results and indicate that the  
379 agricultural use of PGPR is not widely applicable but depends on the genotype that  
380 is cultivated. In some cases, commercial inoculants of PGPR have been developed  
381 for agricultural use but their widespread application remains limited due to  
382 inconsistent performance in different environments and poor understanding of the  
383 mechanisms involved in their ability to promote plant growth (Richardson, 2001).  
384 However, even considering the set limitations, the use of PGPR remains a good  
385 option in terms of cost-effectiveness and potential for technological improvement.  
386 Another valuable plant-microbe interaction, namely mycorrhizal symbiosis, is based  
387 on the mutualistic exchange of C from the plants in return for P and other nutrients  
388 from the fungus. Influx of P in roots colonized by mycorrhizal fungi can be 3 to 5

389 times higher than in nonmycorrhizal roots (Smith and Read, 1997). Some plant P  
390 transporters from the Pht1 family have been found to be expressed only at the  
391 plant/mycorrhiza interface during symbiosis in different food crops and are repressed  
392 under high P conditions (Bucher, 2007). The presence of these transporters is  
393 essential to avoid early degradation of this interface suggesting that the delivery of P  
394 and probably other nutrients to the plant is necessary to maintain symbiosis (Javot et  
395 al., 2007). This knowledge might indicate how improvement of the mycorrhizal P  
396 acquisition pathway is possible. However, further basic research of the symbiotic  
397 interaction is needed. The study of plant genotypic variation for responsiveness to  
398 mycorrhization and for P acquisition from mycorrhiza could provide a basis for  
399 breeding or engineering crop plants with higher responsiveness to mycorrhization  
400 and higher P acquisition through the mycorrhizal pathway.

401

### 402 **3. Considerations in a broader perspective**

403

404 As previously discussed, there are two different types of P deficient soils: (1) soils  
405 with an overall low total P content and (2) soils with high total P but with low  
406 availability of P for the plant because of strong P retention (Driessen et al., 2001).  
407 Enhancing the plant's efficiency to acquire P is a good strategy, whether this P  
408 originates (partly) from P fertilizer in low P soils or from endogenous soil P in  
409 highly P-fixing soils. However, the consequence of increased plant acquisition  
410 efficiency would be a lowering of the total soil P content over time. Whether this  
411 lowering will occur fast or slow, will depend on the initial total P content of the soil,  
412 the cropping intensity and crop P requirements. To avoid ending up with overall low  
413 P soil contents, it is advisable to add small amounts of P fertilizer or slow release P  
414 fertilizer, such as rock phosphate, to the soil. This strategy avoids the rapid loss of  
415 added P through soil leaching in poor soils that are unable to retain P. In P-fixing  
416 soils, addition of small amounts or slow release P fertilizer will avoid the fixation of  
417 P fertilizer which is not directly taken up by the plant. Combining this strategy with  
418 an improved plant efficiency to acquire P will ensure a higher recovery of applied P  
419 and therefore, less P fertilizer will be required. However, it has to be taken into

420 account that P fertilizer is not always available nor affordable for small-scale poor  
421 farmers. Moreover, at the current world-wide rate of fertilizer application, the readily  
422 available sources of high-grade phosphate rocks may become rare within the next 60  
423 to 90 years and this will make P fertilizer prices rise considerably (Runge-Metzer,  
424 1995; Lambers et al., 2006; Yuan and Liu, 2008). Without any P additions, the soil  
425 will eventually run out of P. To reduce the dependency on P fertilizer, it would be  
426 interesting to enhance the plant's internal P use efficiency. P use efficiency is  
427 defined as the capacity to produce a large amount of organic matter per unit of P  
428 taken up (Rengel and Marschner 2005). Plants with enhanced P use efficiency show  
429 higher growth for the same amount of P taken up. Recently, Su et al. (2009)  
430 identified 6 QTL controlling P utilization efficiency in Chinese winter wheat pot and  
431 field trials. Moreover, positive linkages were observed between QTL for P  
432 acquisition efficiency and P use efficiency at two loci, showing the possibility of  
433 improving P acquisition and P use simultaneously.

434

435 Natural environments typically comprise a combination of different abiotic stresses.  
436 In acid soils for example, plant growth is inhibited principally because of toxicity  
437 from excess aluminum (Al) and lack of nutrients, especially P (von Uexküll and  
438 Mutert, 1995). Some root adaptation mechanisms to low P are also useful to cope  
439 with other abiotic stresses. Suboptimal P and iron (Fe) availability both trigger an  
440 increase in root hair density and length (Schikora and Schmidt, 2001). A well-known  
441 mechanism to prevent Al from penetrating inside the root cells is the exudation of  
442 organic acid anions complexing Al (Miyasaka et al., 1991; Delhaize et al., 1993; Ma  
443 et al., 1997). Organic acid exudation is equally used by plants to release P by  
444 complexing and chelating cations bound to P and compete for sorption sites with P  
445 on clays and Fe and Al oxides (Schachtman et al., 1998; Hinsinger et al., 2001).  
446 Breeding attempts have focused on developing larger root systems in crop plants in  
447 order to increase ability to compete for several nutrients (Malamy, 2005).

448 One of the mechanisms to increase access to P, is a greater topsoil exploration  
449 resulting in shallower roots under P deficiency. However, this may inadvertently  
450 result in reduced water acquisition since water availability typically increases with

451 soil depth. As a consequence, plant genotypes selected for adaptation to low P soils  
452 may be more sensible to drought and viceversa (Ho et al., 2004; Lynch and Ho,  
453 2005). However, Beebe et al. (2008) reported on an interesting breeding program  
454 aimed at creating breeding lines of common bean with increased yields under  
455 drought conditions. Some selected drought resistant lines also appeared to expres  
456 superior yields in a low P environment, one of which even outyielded the low P  
457 tolerant check by 41%. This finding indicates that yield potential under drought  
458 conditions and yield potential under low P conditions may not be mutually  
459 exclusive.

460

#### 461 **4. Conclusions**

462

463 Tremendous genetic variation for adaptation to P deficiency exists among food  
464 crops. The study and use of this variation are pivotal for the development of crop  
465 plants with better growth rates and higher yields on P deficient soils. In turn, P  
466 efficient crop varieties with less dependency on P fertilizer are an essential  
467 ingredient of a new sustainable Green Revolution that assures food security for a  
468 growing world population.

469 Adaptation to low P can be achieved by genetic engineering or by molecular assisted  
470 plant breeding, with many possible traits identified so far for mechanistic input. In  
471 addition, food crops can be inoculated with plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria  
472 (PGPR) or mycorrhizae to improve their P acquisition. Combining these three  
473 strategies might provide a novel and useful approach on the road to low P adapted  
474 food crops.

475

#### 476 **5. Acknowledgments**

477

478 We thank Prof. E.V. Quadros for critical reading of the manuscript. This work is  
479 supported by a grant from the Flemish Interuniversity Council (VLIR) to L.R.

480

#### 481 **6. References**

482

483 Akthar, M.S., Oki, Y., Adachi, T., 2008. Genetic variation in phosphorus acquisition  
484 and utilization efficiency from sparingly soluble P-sources by *Brassica* cultivars  
485 under P-stress environment. *J. Agric. Crop Sci.* 194, 380-392.

486 Anderson, G., 1980. Assessing organic phosphorus in soil. In: Khasawneh, F.E.,  
487 Sample, E.C., Kamprath, E.J., (Eds.), *The Role of Phosphorus in Agriculture*.  
488 American Society of Agronomy, Madison, WI, USA, pp. 411–431.

489 Bari, R., Datt Pant, B., Stitt, M., Scheible, W., 2006. PHO2, microRNA399 and  
490 PHR1 define a phosphate-signaling pathway in plants. *Plant Phys.* 141, 988-999.

491 Bates, T.R., Lynch, J.P., 1996. Stimulation of root hair elongation in *Arabidopsis*  
492 *thaliana* by low phosphorus availability. *Plant Cell Environ.* 19, 529-538.

493 Beebe, S.E., Rao, I.M., Cajiao, C., Grajales, M., 2008. Selection for drought  
494 resistance in common bean also improves yield in phosphorus limited and favorable  
495 environments. *Crop Sci.* 48, 582-592.

496 Beebe, S.E., Rojas, M., Yan, X., Blair, M.W., Pedraza, F., Muñoz, F., Tohme, J.,  
497 Lynch, J.P., 2006. Quantitative trait loci for root architecture traits correlated with  
498 phosphorus acquisition in common bean. *Crop Sci.* 46, 413-423.

499 Bucher, M., 2007. Functional biology of plant phosphate uptake at root and  
500 mycorrhiza interfaces. *New Phyt.* 173, 11-26.

501 Delhaize, E., Hebb, D.M., Ryan, P.R., 2001. Expression of a *Pseudomonas*  
502 *aeruginosa* citrate synthase gene in tobacco is not associated with either enhanced  
503 citrate accumulation or efflux. *Plant Phys.* 125, 2059-2067.

504 Delhaize, E., Ryan, P.R., Randall, P.J., 1993. Aluminum tolerance in wheat  
505 (*Triticum aestivum* L.) II. Aluminum-stimulated excretion of malic acid from root  
506 apices. *Plant Phys.* 103, 695-702.

507 Delhaize, E., Taylor, P., Hocking, P.J., Simpson, R.J., Ryan, P.R., Richardson, A.E.,  
508 2009. Transgenic barley (*Hordeum vulgare* L.) expressing the wheat aluminium  
509 resistance gene (TaALMT1) shows enhanced phosphorus nutrition and grain  
510 production when grown on an acid soil. *Plant Biotech. J.* 7(5), 391-400.

511 Doerge, R., 2001. Mapping and analysis of quantitative trait loci in experimental  
512 populations. *Nature Rev. Gen.* 3, 43-52.

513 Dong, B., Rengel, Z., Delhaize, E., 1998. Uptake and translocation of phosphate by  
514 *pho2* mutant and wild-type seedlings of *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Planta* 205, 251-256.

515 Drew, M.C., 1975. Comparison of effects of a localized supply of phosphate, nitrate,  
516 ammonium and potassium on growth of seminal root system, and shoot, in barley.  
517 *New Phyt.* 75, 479-490.

518 Driessen, P., Deckers, S., Spaargaren, O., Nachtergaele, F., 2001. Lecture notes on  
519 the major soils of the world. FAO.

520 Fageria, N.K., Baligar, V.C., Li, Y.C., 2008. The role of nutrient efficient plants in  
521 improving crop yields in the twenty first century. *J. Plant Nutr.* 31, 1121-1157.

522 Fairhurst, T., Lefroy, E., Mutert, E., Batjes, N.H., 1999. The importance, distribution  
523 and causes of phosphorus deficiency as a constraint to crop production in the tropics.  
524 *Agrofor. Forum* 9, 2-8.

525 Fallik, E., Sarig, S., Okon, Y., 1994. Morphology and physiology of plant roots  
526 associated with *Azospirillum*. In: Okon, Y. (Ed.), *Azospirillum/plant associations*.  
527 CRC Press, Boca Raton, pp. 77-86.

528 Fan, M.S., Zhu, J., Richards, C., Brown, K.M., Lynch, J.P., 2003. Physiological  
529 roles for aerenchyma in phosphorus-stressed roots. *Funct. Plant Biol.* 30(5), 493-  
530 506.

531 Fujii, H., Chiou, T.J., Lin, S.I., Aung, K., Zhu, J.K., 2005. A miRNA involved in  
532 phosphate-starvation response in *Arabidopsis*. *Curr. Biol.* 15, 2038-2043.

533 Gahoonia, T.S., Care, D., Nielsen, N.E., 1997. Root hairs and phosphorus  
534 acquisition of wheat and barley cultivars. *Plant Soil* 191, 181-188.

535 George, T.S., Richardson, A.E., Hadobas, P.A., Simpson, R.J., 2004.  
536 Characterization of transgenic *Trifolium subterraneum* L. which expresses *phyA* and  
537 releases extracellular phytase, growth and phosphorus nutrition in laboratory media  
538 and soil. *Plant Cell Environ.* 27, 1351-1361.

539 George, T.S., Simpson, R.J., Hadobas, P.A., Richardson, A.E., 2005. Expression of a  
540 fungal phytase gene in *Nicotiana tabacum* improves phosphorus nutrition of plants  
541 grown in amended soils. *Plant Biotech. J.* 3, 129-140.

542 Gregory, P., 2006. *Plant Roots, Growth, activity and interaction with soils*.  
543 Blackwell Publishing, Oxford.

544 Hamburger, D., Rezzonico, E., MacDonald-Comber, J., Somerville, C.,  
545 Poirier, Y., 2002. Identification and characterization of the *Arabidopsis* PHO1 gene  
546 involved in phosphate loading to the xylem. *Plant Cell* 14, 889-902.

547 Hammond, J.P., Broadley, M.R., White, P.J., King, G.J., Bowen, H.C., Hayden, R.,  
548 Meacham, M.C., Mead, A., Overs, T., Spracklen, W.P., Greenwood, D.J., 2008.  
549 Shoot yield drives phosphorus use efficiency in *Brassica oleraceae* and correlates  
550 with root architecture traits. *J. Exp. Bot.* 60, 1953-1968.

551 Hammond, J.P., White, P.J., 2008. Sucrose transport in the phloem, integrating root  
552 responses to phosphorus starvation. *J. Exp. Bot.* 59, 93-109.

553 Hermans, C., Hammond, J.P., White, P.J., Verbruggen, N., 2006. How do plants  
554 respond to nutrient shortage by biomass allocation? *Trends Plant Sci.* 11, 610-617.

555 Heuer, S., Lu, X., Chin, J.H., Tanaka, J.P., Kanamori, H., Matsumoto, T., De Leon,  
556 T., Ulat, V.J., Ismail, A.M., Yano, M., Wissuwa, M., 2009. Comparative sequence  
557 analysis of the major quantitative trait locus *phosphorus uptake 1 (Pup1)* reveal a  
558 complex genetic structure. *Plant Biotech. J.* 7, 456-471.

559 Hinsinger, P., 2001. Bioavailability of soil inorganic P in the rhizosphere as affected  
560 by root-induced chemical changes: a review. *Plant Soil* 237, 173-195.

561 Ho, M.D., McCannon, B.D., Lynch, J.P., 2004. Optimization modelling of plant root  
562 architecture for water and phosphorus acquisition. *J. Theor. Biol.* 226, 331-340.

563 Hodge, A., 2004. The plastic plant: root responses to heterogeneous supplies of  
564 nutrients. *New Phyt.* 162, 9-24.

565 Hodge, A., 2009. Root decisions. *Plant Cell Environ.* 32, 628-640.

566 Hodge, A., Berta, G., Doussan, C., Merchan, F., Crespi, M., 2009. Plant root growth,  
567 architecture and function. *Plant Soil* 321, 153-187.

568 Hoffland, E., Wei, C., Wissuwa, M., 2006. Organic acid exudation by lowland rice  
569 (*Oryza sativa* L.) at zinc and phosphorus deficiency. *Plant Soil* 283, 155-162.

570 Jacobsen, I., Leggett, M.E., Richardson, A.E., 2005. Rhizosphere microorganisms  
571 and plant phosphorus uptake. In: Sims, J.T. and Sharpley, A.N. (Eds.), *Phosphorus,*  
572 *agriculture and the environment.* Soil Sci. Soc. America, Madison, pp. 437-494.

573 Javot, H., Penmetsa, R.V., Terzaghi, N., Cook, D.R., Harrison, M.J., 2007. A  
574 *Medicago truncatula* phosphate transporter indispensable for the arbuscular  
575 mycorrhizal symbiosis. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 104, 1720-1725.

576 Kaepler, S.M., Parke, J.L., Muelle, S.M., Senior, L., Stuber, C., Tracy, W.F., 2000.  
577 Variation among maize inbred lines and determination of QTL for growth at low  
578 phosphorus and responsiveness to arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi. Crop Sci. 40, 358-  
579 364.

580 Kucey, R.M.N., 1988. Plant growth-altering effects of *Azospirillum brasilense* and  
581 *Bacillus C-11-25* on two wheat cultivars. J. Appl. Bact. 64, 187-196.

582 Lambers, H., Shan, M.W., Cramer, M.D., Pearse, S.J., Veneklaas, E.J., 2006. Root  
583 structure and functioning for efficient acquisition of phosphorus: matching  
584 morphological and physiological traits. Ann. Bot. 98, 693-713.

585 Li, G., Yang, S., Li, M., Qiao, Y., Wang, J., 2009. Functional analysis of an  
586 *Aspergillus ficuum* phytase gene in *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* and its root-specific,  
587 secretory expression in transgenic soybean plants. Biotechn. Letter 31, 1297-1303.

588 Liao, H., Rubio, G., Yan, X., Cao, A., Brown, K.M., Lynch, J.P., 2001. Effect of  
589 phosphorus availability on basal root shallowness in common bean. Plant Soil 232,  
590 69-79.

591 López-Bucio, J., Cruz-Ramírez, A., Herrera-Estrella, L., 2003. The role of nutrient  
592 availability in regulating root architecture. Curr. Opin. Plant Biol. 6, 280-287.

593 López-Bucio, J., de la Vega, O.M., Guevara-García, A., Herrera-Estrella, L., 2000.  
594 Enhanced phosphorus uptake in transgenic tobacco plants that overproduce citrate.  
595 Nature 405, 450-453.

596 López-Marín, H.D., Rao, I.M., Blair, M.W., 2009. Quantitative trait loci for root  
597 morphology traits under aluminum stress in common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.).  
598 Theor. Appl. Gen. 119(3), 449-458.

599 Lung, S., Chan, W., Yip, W., Wang, L., Young, E.C., Lim, B.L., 2005. Secretion of  
600 beta-propeller phytase from tobacco and *Arabidopsis* roots enhances phosphorus  
601 utilization. Plant Sci. 169, 341-349.

602 Lynch, J.P., 2007. Roots of the second green revolution. Austr. J. Bot. 55, 493-512.

603 Lynch, J.P., Brown, K.M., 2006. Whole-plant adaptations to low phosphorus  
604 availability. In: Huang, B. (Ed.), Plant-Environment Interactions. CRC Press Inc.,  
605 Boca Raton, pp. 209-242.

606 Lynch, J.P., Ho, M.D., 2005. Rhizoeconomics, Carbon costs of phosphorus  
607 acquisition. *Plant Soil* 269, 45-56.

608 Ma, X., Wright, E., Ge, Y., Bell, J., Yajun, X., Bouton, J.H., Wang, Z., 2009.  
609 Improving phosphorus acquisition of white clover (*Trifolium repens* L.) by  
610 transgenic expression of plant-derived phytase and acid phosphatase genes. *Plant*  
611 *Sci.* 176, 479-488.

612 Ma, J.F., Zheng, S.J., Matsumoto, H., Hiradate, S., 1997. Detoxifying aluminium  
613 with buckwheat. *Nature* 390, 569-570.

614 Malamy, J.E., 2005. Intrinsic and environmental response pathways that regulate  
615 root system architecture. *Plant Cell Environ.* 28, 67-77.

616 Miklas, P.N., Kelly, J.D., Beebe, S.E., Blair, M.W., 2006. Common bean breeding  
617 for resistance against biotic and abiotic stresses, from classical to MAS breeding.  
618 *Euphytica* 147, 105-131.

619 Miller, C.R., Ochoa, I., Nielsen, K.L., Beck, D., Lynch, J.P., 2003. Genetic variation  
620 for adventitious rooting in response to low phosphorus availability, potential utility  
621 for phosphorus acquisition from stratified soils. *Funct. Plant Biol.* 30, 973-985.

622 Miura, K., Rus, A., Sharkhuu, A., Yokoi, S., Karthikeyan, A.S., Raghothama, K.G.,  
623 Baek, D., Koo, Y.D., Jin, J.B., Bressan, R.A., Yun, D., Hasegawa, P.M., 2005. The  
624 *Arabidopsis* SUMO E3-ligase SIZ1 controls phosphate deficiency responses. *Proc.*  
625 *Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* 102, 7760-7765.

626 Miyasaka, S.C., Buta, J.G., Howell, R.K., Foy, C.D., 1991. Mechanism of aluminum  
627 tolerance in snapbeans – Root exudation of citric acid. *Plant Phys.* 96, 737-743.

628 Mollier, A., Pellerin, S., 1999. Maize root system growth and development as  
629 influenced by P deficiency. *J. Exp. Bot.* 50, 487-497.

630 Mudge, S.R., Rae, A.L., Diatloff, E., Smith, F.W., 2002. Expression analysis  
631 suggests novel roles for members of the Pht1 family of phosphate transporters in  
632 *Arabidopsis*. *Plant J.* 31(3), 341-353.

633

634 Nielsen, K.I., Eshel, A., Lynch, J.P., 2001. The effect of phosphorus availability on  
635 the carbon economy of contrasting common bean genotypes. *J. Exp. Bot.* 52 (355),  
636 329-339.

637 Ochoa, I.E., Blair, M.W., Lynch, J.P., 2006. QTL analysis for adventitious root  
638 formation in common bean under contrasting phosphorus availability. *Crop Sci.* 46,  
639 1609-1621.

640 Park, M.R., Baek, S.H., de los Reyes, B.G., Yun, S.J., 2007. Overexpression of a  
641 high-affinity phosphate transporter gene from tobacco (NtPT1) enhances phosphate  
642 uptake and accumulation in transgenic rice plants. *Plant Soil* 292(1-2), 259-269.

643 Parniske, M., 2008. Arbuscular mycorrhiza: the mother of plant root endosymbioses.  
644 *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 6(10), 763-775.

645 Pérez-Torres, C., López-Bucio, J., Cruz-Ramírez, A., Ibarra-Laclette, E., Dharmasiri,  
646 S., Estelle, M., Herrera-Estrella, L., 2008. Phosphate availability alters lateral root  
647 development in *Arabidopsis* by modulating auxin sensitivity via a mechanism  
648 involving the TIR1 auxin receptor. *Plant Cell* 20, 3258-3272.

649 Rae, A.L., Jarmey, J.M., Mudge, S.R., Smith, F.W., 2004. Over-expression of a  
650 high-affinity phosphate transporter in transgenic barley plants does not enhance  
651 phosphate uptake rates. *Funct. Plant Biol.* 31(2), 141-148.

652 Ranathunge, K., Steude, E., Lafitte, R., 2003. Control of water uptake by rice (*Oryza*  
653 *sativa* L.), role of the outer part of the root. *Planta* 217, 193-205.

654 Rausch, C., Bucher, M., 2002. Molecular mechanisms of phosphate transport in  
655 plants. *Planta* 216, 23-37.

656 Remans, R., Beebe, S., Blair, M., Manrique, G., Tovar, E., Rao, I., Croonenborghs,  
657 A., Torres-Gutierrez, R., El-Howeity, M., Michiels, J., Vanderleyden, J., 2008a.  
658 Physiological and genetic analyses of root responsiveness to auxin-producing plant  
659 growth-promoting rhizobacteria in common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.). *Plant Soil*  
660 302(1-2), 149-161.

661 Remans, R., Ramaekers, L., Schelkens, S., Hernandez, G., García, A., Luis Reyes, J.,  
662 Mendez, N., Toscano, V., Mulling, M., Galvez, L., Vanderleyden, J., 2008b. Effect  
663 of *Rhizobium-Azospirillum* coinoculation on nitrogen fixation and yield of two

664 contrasting *Phaseolus vulgaris* genotypes cultivated across different environments in  
665 Cuba. *Plant Soil* 312(1-2), 25-37.

666 Rengel, Z., Marschner, P., 2005. Nutrient availability and management in the  
667 rhizosphere: exploiting genotypic differences. *New Phyt.* 168, 305-312.

668 Richardson, A.E., 2001. Prospects for using soil microorganisms to improve the  
669 acquisition of phosphorus by plants. *Austr. J. Plant Phys.* 28, 897-906.

670 Richardson, A.E., 2009. Regulating the phosphorus nutrition of plants, molecular  
671 biology meeting agronomic needs. *Plant Soil* 322, 17-24.

672 Richardson, A.E., Barea, J., McNeill, A.M., Prigent-Combaret, C., 2009a.  
673 Acquisition of phosphorus and nitrogen in the rhizosphere and plant growth  
674 promotion by microorganisms. *Plant Soil* 339, 305-339.

675 Richardson, A.E., Hadobas, P.A., Simpson, R.J., 2001. Phytate as a source of  
676 phosphorus for the growth of transgenic *Trifolium subterraneum* L.. *Plant nutrition –*  
677 *Food security and sustainability of agro-ecosystems* 92, 560-561.

678 Richardson, A.E., Hocking, P.J., Simpson, R.J., George, T.S., 2009b. Plant  
679 mechanisms to optimise access to soil phosphorus. *Crop Past. Sci.* 60, 124-143.

680 Rubio, V., Linhares, F., Solano, R., Martin, A.C., Iglesias, J., Leyva, A., Paz-Ares,  
681 J., 2001. A conserved MYB transcription factor involved in phosphate starvation  
682 signaling both in vascular plants and in unicellular algae. *Genes Dev.* 15, 2122-2133.

683 Runge-Metzer, A., 1995. Closing the cycle: Obstacles to efficient P management for  
684 improved global food security. In: Tiessen, B. (Ed.), *Phosphorus in the global*  
685 *environment: Transfers, cycles and Management.* John Wiley and Sons, New York,  
686 pp. 27-42.

687 Sanchez, P.A., 1976. *Properties and management of soils in the Tropics.* John Wiley  
688 and Sons, New York, USA.

689 Schachtman, D.P., Reid, R.J., Ayling, S.M., 1998. Update on phosphorus uptake.  
690 Phosphorus uptake by plants: from soil to cell. *Plant Phys.* 116, 447-453.

691 Schikora, A., Schmidt, W., 2001. Acclimative changes in root epidermal cell fate in  
692 response to Fe and P deficiency: a specific role for auxin? *Protoplasma* 218, 67-75.

693 Shen, H., Yan, X., Zheng, S., Wang, X., 2002. Exudation of organic acids in  
694 common bean as related to mobilization of aluminum- and iron-bound phosphates.  
695 *Env. Exp. Bot.* 48, 1-9.

696 Shenoy, V.V., Kalagudi, G.M., 2005. Enhancing plant phosphorus use efficiency for  
697 sustainable cropping. *Biotechn. Adv.* 23, 501-513.

698 Shin, H., Shin, H.S., Dewbre, G.R., Harrison, M.J., 2004. Phosphate transport in  
699 *Arabidopsis*: Pht1;1 and Pht1;4 play a major role in phosphate acquisition from both  
700 low- and high-phosphate environments. *Plant J.* 39(4), 629-642.

701 Smith, S.E., Read, D.J., 1997. Mycorrhizal symbiosis. Academic Press, New York.

702 Steele, K.A., Price, A.H., Shashidhar, H.E., Witcombe, J.R., 2006. Marker-assisted  
703 selection to introgress rice QTLs controlling root traits into an Indian upland rice  
704 variety. *Theor. Appl. Gen.* 112, 208-221.

705 Svistoonoff, S., Creff, A., Reymond, M., Sigoillot-Claude, C., Ricaud, L., Blanchet,  
706 A., Nussaume, L., Desnos, T., 2007. Root tip contact with low-phosphate media  
707 reprograms plant root architecture. *Nature Gen. Letter* 39(6), 792-796.

708 Su, J., Li, H., Li, B., Jing, R., Tong, Y., Li, Z., 2009. Detection of QTLs for  
709 phosphorus use efficiency in relation to agronomic performance of wheat grown  
710 under phosphorus sufficient and limited conditions. *Plant Sci.* 176, 824-836.

711 Tesfaye, M., Temple, S.J., Allan, D.L., Vance, C.P., Samac, D.A., 2001.  
712 Overexpression of malate dehydrogenase in transgenic alfalfa enhances organic acid  
713 exudation synthesis and confers tolerance to aluminum. *Plant Phys.* 127, 1836-1844.

714 Ullrich-Eberius, C., Novacky, A., Van Bel, A., 1984. Phosphate uptake in *Lemna*  
715 *gibba* G1, energetics and kinetics. *Planta* 161, 46-52.

716 Valdéz-López, O., Hernández, G., 2008. Transcriptional regulation and signaling in  
717 phosphorus starvation, what about legumes? *J. Integr. Plant Biol.* 50(10), 1213-1222.

718 Vance, C.P., Uhde-Stone, C., Allan, D.L., 2003. Phosphorus acquisition and use,  
719 critical adaptations by plants for securing a nonrenewable resource. *New Phyt.* 157,  
720 423-447.

721 von Uexküll, H.R., Mutert, E., 1995. Global extent, development and economic  
722 impact of acid soils. *Plant Soil* 171, 1-5.

723 Wasaki, J., Maruyama, H., Tanaka, M., Yamamura, T., Dateki, H., Shinano, T., Ito,  
724 S., Osaki, M., 2009. Overexpression of the LASAP2 gene for secretory acid  
725 phosphatase in white lupin improves the phosphorus uptake and growth of tobacco  
726 plants. *Soil Sci. Plant Nutr.* 55, 107-113.

727 Wissuwa, M., 2003. How do plants achieve tolerance to phosphorus deficiency?  
728 Small causes with big effects. *Plant Phys.* 133, 1947-1958.

729 Wissuwa, M., Gatdula, K., Ismail, A., 2005. Candidate gene characterization at the  
730 *Pup1* locus, a major QTL increasing tolerance to phosphorus deficiency. In:  
731 Toriyama, K., Heong, K.L., Hardy, B. (Eds.), *Rice is life, Scientific perspectives for*  
732 *the 21<sup>st</sup> century*. IRRI, Manila, pp. 83-85.

733 Xu, G.H., Chague, V., Melamed-Bessudo, C., Kapulnik, Y., Jain, A., Raghothama,  
734 K.G., Levy, A.A., Silber, A., 2007. Functional characterization of LePT4:  
735 a phosphate transporter in tomato with mycorrhiza-enhanced expression. *J. Exp. Bot.*  
736 58(10), 2491-2501.

737 Yan, X., Liao, H., Beebe, S.E., Blair, M.W., Lynch, J.P., 2004. QTL mapping of root  
738 hairs and acid exudation traits and their relationship to phosphorus uptake in  
739 common bean. *Plant Soil* 265, 17-29.

740 Yang, H., Knapp, J., Koirala, P., Rajagopal, D., Ann Peer, W., Silbart, L.K.,  
741 Murphy, A., Gaxiola, R., 2007. Enhanced phosphorus nutrition in monocots and  
742 dicots over-expressing a phosphorus-responsive type I H<sup>+</sup>-pyrophosphatase. *Plant*  
743 *Biotechn. J.* 5, 735-745.

744 Yuan, H., Liu, D., 2008. Signaling components involved in plant responses to  
745 phosphate starvation. *J. Integr. Plant Biol.* 50(7), 849-859.

746 Zakhleniuk, O.V., Raines, C.A., Lloyd, J.C., 2001. *pho3*: a phosphorus-deficient  
747 mutant of *Arabidopsis thaliana* (L.) Heynh. *Planta* 212(4), 529-534.

748 Zhang, Q.F., 2007. Strategies for developing green super rice. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*  
749 *U.S.A.* 104, 16402-16409.

750 Zhu, J.M., Kaeppler, S., Lynch, J., 2005. Topsoil foraging and phosphorus  
751 acquisition efficiency in maize. *Funct. Plant Biol.* 32, 749-762.

752 Zhu, J.M., Lynch, J.P., 2004. The contribution of lateral rooting to phosphorus  
753 acquisition efficiency in maize seedlings. *Funct. Plant Biol.* 31, 949-958.  
754 Zimmermann, P., Zardi, G., Lehmann, M., Zeder, C., Amrhein, N., Frossard, E.,  
755 Bucher, M., 2003. Engineering the root-soil interface via targeted expression of a  
756 synthetic phytase gene in trichoblasts. *Plant Biotechn. J.* 1, 353–360.  
757